

EXECUTIVE SESSION

- I. A regular meeting of the Board of Trustees of the Charleston County School District was held on Monday, February 14, 2011, with the following members of the Board present: Mr. Chris Fraser – Chair, Mrs. Ann Oplinger - Vice Chair, Mr. Craig Ascue, Mrs. Cindy Bohn Coats, Rev. Chris Collins, Mrs. Toya Hampton-Green, Mrs. Elizabeth Kandrac, Mrs. Elizabeth Moffly, Mrs. Mary Ann Taylor, and Dr. Nancy J. McGinley, Superintendent and Executive Secretary. Staff members Mr. Michael Bobby, Mr. John Emerson, Dr. Brenda Nelson, Mrs. Audrey Lane, and Mr. Bill Lewis were also in attendance.

Chairman Fraser called the meeting of February 14, 2011 to order at 4:00 p.m. Mrs. Oplinger moved, seconded by Mrs. Bohn Coats, approval of a motion to go into Executive Session to discuss agenda items listed below. The motion was approved unanimously.

- 1.1: Student Transfer Appeals
- 1.2: Legal Matter
- 1.3: Personnel Matter – Budget Reductions
- 1.4: Property Matter – Business Negotiation/Land Acquisition

OPEN SESSION

II. CALL TO ORDER, INVOCATION/MOMENT OF SILENCE, & PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

At 5:15 p.m. Chairman Fraser called the February 14, 2010 Open Session meeting to order. Then he led the group in a Moment of Silence followed Pledge of Allegiance.

Mrs. Green moved, seconded by Mrs. Oplinger, to adopt agenda. The motion was approved 8-1 (Mrs. Kandrac opposed).

III. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

IV. SPECIAL RECOGNITIONS (20 minutes)

There were no Special Recognitions to come before the Board at this meeting.

V. SUPERINTENDENT'S REPORT

5.1 Superintendent's Report

The Superintendent reported the following:

- The Board held a productive workshop on last Thursday.
- A meeting schedule has been posted on district's website to discuss the City of North Charleston High School Renaissance Project. Those meetings will be held Tuesday, February 22nd and Wednesday, February 23rd, 6:00 – 7:00pm.
- Staff will bring Teacher Effectiveness information back to the Board in March.
- Staff will present a Budget Overview and how staff approached reductions later during the meeting. Key points about small school pairings, unlike closures, will allow small schools to remain open share resources—one supervisor overseeing two campuses.

Also during the Superintendent's Report, Dr. McGinley responded to Mrs. Kandrac's question about why Sanders Clyde pairing with Fraser did not work. Dr. McGinley said they were both failing schools. The schools on the table are average and above. In addition, Dr. McGinley said Sanders Clyde and Fraser had a combined enrollment of over 700 students.

VI. VISITORS, PUBLIC COMMUNICATIONS (Not to exceed 30 minutes)

1. Mr. E. M. "Bud" Skidmore addressed the Board regarding Jane Edwards. He thanked board for not bringing a proposal to close schools.
2. Ms. Beth Compton opposed the proposed change to the student transfer policy.

3. Dr. Franklin Ashley addressed the Board about transparency questioning staff's issuance of a no trespass order to an individual who has an interest in the school district.
4. Mr. Jon Butzon expressed concerns about the proposed transfer policy revision. He also requested the Board to revise the schedule of community meetings to talk about the N. Charleston Renaissance Project.
5. Ms. Shanta Barron Millan, Chairperson of District 23 Constituent Board, expressed concerns regarding school pairing citing timing and Constituent Board notification.
6. Ms. Suzanne Coffman addressed the Board regarding the 5th Grade Strings Program at School of the Arts. She urged the Board to reconsider budget cuts regarding same.
7. Ms. Barbara Ramsey expressed concerns about school pairing proposal for Stono Park. She suggested that it could impact student achievement. She urged the Board to reconsider decision regarding school pairings.
8. Ms. Susan Smith encouraged the board to speed up Laing project.
9. Rev. Nelson Rivers, III - pastor of Charity Missionary Baptist Church, expressed concerns about pace and process for community meetings for schools in N. Charleston.
10. Mr. Thomas Colleton, a District 1 Constituent Board representative, addressed the Board regarding school pairings. He urged the Board to look at other ways to address budget needs and expressed concerns about lack of information shared with Constituent Boards.
11. Ms. Heather Dolan opposed the proposal to eliminate the strings program.

VII. APPROVAL OF MINUTES/EXECUTIVE SESSION AGENDA ITEMS

- 7.1:** A. Open Session Minutes of January 20, 2011 (Special Called Meeting) – Rev. Collins moved, seconded by Mrs. Oplinger, approval of the Special Called meeting of January 20, 2011. The motion was approved 9-0.

Mrs. Kandrak suggested the meeting be listed as a telephonic session and document that new media was present.

- B. Open Session Minutes of January 21, 2011 (Special Called Meeting) – Mrs. Oplinger moved, seconded by Mr. Ascue, approval of the Special Called meeting of January 21, 2011 with noted revision. The motion was approved 9-0.

Mrs. Kandrak noted that news media was not present when the actual vote took place.

- C. Open Session Minutes of January 24, 2011 – **PULLED**. No action taken.

- 7.2:** Motions of Executive Session of February 14, 2011

1.1: Student Transfer Appeals

Mrs. Oplinger moved, second by Mrs. Green, approval of student transfer appeals # 1-7, 10-18, 20-28, and 30-31, 8 for Whitesides and not the other school requested. Student transfer appeals 9, 10, 19 were approved under No Child Left Behind and student transfer appeal #29 was denied because of Lack of Space. The motion was approved 9-0.

- 1.2: Legal Matter** – The Board discussed a Legal Matter in Executive Session. No action was taken.

- 1.3: Personnel Matter – Budget Reductions** - The Board discussed a Personnel Matter in Executive Session. No action was taken.

- 1.4: Property Matter – Business Negotiation/Land Acquisition** -The Board discussed a Property Matter in Executive Session. No action was taken.

7.3: **Financial Minutes of January 24, 2011**

Mr. Ascue moved, seconded by Rev. Collins, approval of the amended Financial Minutes meeting of January 24, 2011. The motion was approved 8-1 (Mrs. Kandrak opposed).

Note: The Financial Minutes will be amended to correct the amount for 75 Calhoun Street renovations. Also, Mrs. Kandrak expressed concerns about not having the Board minutes of January 24, 2011 and said she would vote against the Financial Minutes because she did not have it. Also, Mrs. Coats said she would like the financial minutes amended to show the amount saved on the Calhoun Street Project.

VIII. COMMITTEE REPORT(S)

8.1: Finance & Audit Committee

Meeting on Feb 2nd. She spoke about recommendation to change the committee name, MBE Utilization Plan and CCSD Procurement Audit and CCSD Procurement Code, all Committee recommends approval. On behalf of the Finance and Audit Committee, Mrs. Coats presented the following items to the Board.

- A. **Procurement Audit for FY09-10 – Mr. Bobby** - approval of the Procurement Audit for FY09-10 presented by Greene, Finney & Horton, Certified Public Accountants. The motion was approved 9-0.
- B. **CCSD Procurement Code – Mr. Bobby** - approval of the updated Model CCSD Procurement Code (Version 1.5).

Rev. Collins asked it be tabled until March 2011 because he wasn't able to review from agenda on thumb drive provided and just got a hard copy today. After Mr. Bobby consulted with Mr. Lewis and Procurement about timing of the bids and how it would be impacted, he agreed that the CCSD Procurement Code could be delayed until February 28, 2011.

- C. **MBE Utilization Plan – Mr. Bobby** - The Board received as information the MBE Utilization Plan with its combined verifiable goal of 20%, a combination of 10% certified MBEs/SWMBEs and 10% non-certified MBEs/SWMBEs.
- D. **Proposed Audit and Finance Committee Charter Revision** – After Mrs. Kandrak stated this item could not be acted on because it's not listed as action or information, Mrs. Green moved, seconded by Mrs. Oplinger to modify the agenda to make 8.1D an Action Item. Then Chairman Fraser called for the vote to modify agenda item 8.1. The item was approved 7-2 (Mrs. Kandrak and Mrs. Moffly opposed).

During discussion Mrs. Coats responded to Mrs. Moffly's concern about having two separate committees (Audit and Finance). After discussion, Mr. Fraser called for the vote to approve the Proposed Audit and Finance Committee Charter Revision. The motion was approved 7-2 (Mrs. Kandrak and Mrs. Moffly opposed).

- 8.2: Policy Committee** – Mrs. Oplinger reported that the Policy Committee approved policies listed below. However, she suggested JFABC – Student Transfers be discussed by the Board and returned to committee for additional revisions.

Board Policies – First Reading

- A. **BE – School Board Meetings** - approval of Board policy BE – School Board Meetings. The motion was approved 8-1 (Mrs. Coats opposed). Mrs. Coats said she wanted the policy to reflect information about when new board members are sworn in and take office. Mr. Fraser responded that members take office after they are sworn in.

- B. **BID – Board Member Compensation and Expenses** - approval of Board policy
BID – Board Member Compensation and Expenses.
Mrs. Moffly suggested an additional line was added after Committee reviewed it. Mr. John Emerson said he would have to check the minutes. Mrs. Moffly requested the policy be pulled. Mrs. Green also suggested the policy be amended to remove the words “staff attorney” since also referred as General Counsel. Also, Mrs. Green suggested second sentence mentioning 1/9 of the Board’s budget be amended to specifically mention “1/9 of the board’s travel budget”. No action was taken on this agenda item.
- C. **JFABC – Student Transfers** - Mrs. Oplinger requested Board policy JFABC – Student Transfers be returned to Committee for additional tweaking. Also, in response to Mrs. Oplinger’s request for input from the Board, the input follows:
- Mrs. Moffly said one issue Mr. Emerson mentioned earlier was efforts to capture students in non-performing schools. However, federally, the board can’t keep students in non-performing schools. While she is a big choice school advocate, capacity is also a problem. She suggested staff be more transparent and post openings on website. Mrs. Moffly also suggested convenience be eliminated because the definition is the same as hardship.
 - Mrs. Oplinger suggested language be included about the creation of zones and meeting the needs of all students in the district.
 - Rev. Collins suggested that convenience allows abandonment of schools and enrollment to drop making school closure necessary and promoting segregation.
 - Mrs. Taylor suggested schools be made equitable and have strong curriculums and principals to retain students.
 - Mrs. Coats said she did not want to weaken the policy so she is glad to see it’s going back to the Policy Committee for additional revisions.
 - Mr. Ascue said solid programs and assets would solve that problem to avoid issues related to students transferring from some schools.
 - Mrs. Green suggested the board to continue work on this policy and not wait for zones to be completed. While everything sounds good, there are differences.
 - Mr. Fraser said it was necessary to continue to look at policy until there is equity and choice for all students.

IX. **MANAGEMENT REPORT(S)**

- 9.1 **Capital Projects Report** – The Board received the Capital Projects Report as information. Mr. Michael Bobby highlighted the Capital Projects Report announcing that the amount is now down to \$2.5 million which signifies end to the old building program.

Mr. Bobby also responded to a question from Mrs. Kandrak about the timeline for the Rivers project. Mrs. Kandrak also said she attended seminars at Rivers, she saw so many things that led her believe the school was structurally solid. She questioned why it is being cited seismically endangered? Mr. Bobby referred to the engineers’ report which says it is not seismically safe.

- 9.2 **2011 2nd Quarter Report of SWMBE** – The Board received the SWMBE Report as information. Mr. Frederic Feil also responded to Rev. Collins’ questions about the bid proposal advertisement and suggestion to advertise in the Post and Courier Newspaper and Chronicle, Mr. Feil said funding for advertisements was an issue. While advertisement with the South Carolina Association of School Business Officials is free, the cost is approximately \$1300 to advertise in the Post and Courier newspaper .

X. **Charleston Achieving Excellence UPDATE**

There were no CAE Updates to be presented to the Board at this meeting.

XI. POTENTIAL CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS

11.1: Health Advisory Committee Bylaws – Three versions

Mrs. Moffly suggested the three versions of the Health Advisory Bylaws be returned back to the Policy Committee since she was unaware of the other two versions. Therefore, no action was taken.

- A. Version 1
- B. Version 2
- C. Version 3

11.2: Early Budget Reduction Recommendations – Chairman Fraser stated that there are seven items are recommended for approval. Dr. McGinley clarified that program reductions like strings program is not on tonight's agenda.

1. All Top Level Non-School Administrators (Directors and Above) will take 6% Salary Reductions

In response to Rev. Collins question about position of non-school administrations, Dr. McGinley said administrators were from Bridgeview and Calhoun Street. Mrs. Kandrac questioned how the proposal relates to pay increases, new hiring and contracts. Dr. McGinley said they were the thirty-eight top-level positions. Mrs. Kandrac requested position titles and salary amounts. In response to Mrs. Coats question about furlough days, Mr. Bobby said it was annual leave and/or forced leave. Those who didn't have vacation time would take without pay. Mrs. Green asked about practice. Mrs. Taylor also requested a breakdown of administrators, position, salary and date hired, from the top down. Thirty-eight positions don't say enough. Dr. McGinley said thirty-eight administrators from Academic and Operational side, who are not in schools, is leading the way by starting budget cuts with their own salaries. No furloughs are on table for anyone at this point. Mrs. Kandrac said there were budget issues when she came on the Board. However, at least 5 new administrators have been hired since then. She asked if an intern was hired at a salary above \$50,000 and suggested she could FOIA it. Mrs. Coats applauded the Superintendent for taking the lead. However, she said decisions affecting other employees must be made. Therefore, the info requested would be helpful for the Board to see what they are agreeing to. Mr. Ascue agreed with Mrs. Coats. No action was taken on this proposal.

2. District Job Cuts:

- **Recommend elimination of 60-70 Non-School Based Positions**
- **Reduction in Non-Personnel Budgets**

Mrs. Moffly questioned the redundancies in the district and she also supported the earlier request for information on positions and salaries. Mr. Fraser said the district's Organization Chart will show positions eliminated without names should be provided in Executive Session. Dr. McGinley said she could bring the number of positions in Learning Centers, the Operations Division and Calhoun Street. She also stated that an extensive amount of time was spent making budget decisions. She also said it was hard for others, who are not working in the trenches, to debate. However, the goal is to support academic programs. She went on to say that these folks are doing good work and could be credited with some of the academic success. She urged the Board to support the proposed decisions. Mr. Bobby added that intent is not to expose individuals to be cut. He said CCSD owes it to them to work with them as much as possible. Mrs. Kandrac suggested folks who make \$50,000 or more should be listed, regardless to their positions. Mrs. Coats said she didn't want to question the decision of staff. However, it would eliminate misconceptions. Dr. McGinley said salaries over \$50,000 are published annually and a local radio reporter also read list on radio. She concluded that staff would bring info back to Executive Session so information about

job elimination is not shared in Open Session. No action taken on this proposal.

3. Structural and Program Changes:

Restructuring of Field-based Offices Operational Cost Reductions - Mr. Fraser opted to skip this agenda item. Since no one opposed, no action was taken on this item.

• **B. Close and Relocate Science**

• Closure and Program Reduction Costs

A. Close McNair –

Rev. commented on the building being left vacant. Mrs. Coats applauded move of students back to their home school and asked about placement of staff. Mr. Bobby responded some could be placed. However, he was not sure of staff savings at this time. Mrs. Taylor asked about net savings and utilization of facility. Mr. Bobby responded that maintaining older buildings is costly. He went on to say a moderate level of electricity would be kept on until a decision is made to market or trade. Rev. Collins moved, seconded by Mrs. Coats approval of the recommendation to close McNair. The motion was approved 9-0.

Resource Center – In response to Rev. Collins about the program. Dr. McGinley said three staff members worked there to refurbished science kits. Mrs. Oplinger requested the center remain open. Rev. Collins moved, seconded by Mrs. Coats, approval of the recommendation to close and relocate the Science Resource Center with a vote of 9-0.

C. Reduce Program Costs at Daniel Jenkins Academy – In response to Rev. Collins' question about cost, Dr. McGinley said the per pupil cost was currently too high. Rev. Collins requested an update at the next meeting. He said he supported #1 and #2. Mr. Ascue urged staff to proceed cautiously in cutting alternative programs. He. Rev. Collins moved, seconded by Mrs. Coats approval of the recommendation to reduce program costs at Daniel Jenkins Academy. The motion was approved 9-0.

4. Outsourcing: Day Porters

Mr. Bobby said the district could save \$850-900,000 to eliminate 86 day porters positions. Mr. Bobby said staff had a lot of work to do if moving in this direction. Staff is checking to see if an out-sourced company could hire the individuals impacted. He spoke of other areas outsourced, courier, bus drivers, etc. He said there were different ways to examine how to proceed in best interest of those employees to include ongoing employment for some. Mrs. Green suggested estimated savings be provided as the Board review budget items. Mrs. Green requested savings be posted next to budget reduction proposal.

Mrs. Oplinger moved approval, seconded Mrs. Green, approval of Outsourcing Day Porters. The motion was approved 7-2 (Mrs. Kandrach and Moffly opposed).

5. School-Based (Non-Classroom Reductions):

• **Local decision making** (principal & School Improvement Council decide)

• **Lump Sum Budgeting**

• Eight Positions: Media Clerk, Media Specialist I, Teaching Assistants, Student Concern Specialists, Secretary (all types), Bookkeeper, Data Clerk, General Clerk -

Mrs. Oplinger said she supported the idea because it empowers schools to decide how to best save funds. Mrs. Taylor expressed her support. However she would like to talk to principals about it. Mr. Bobby explained that staff would use average salaries to determine the amount principals would be given. Dr. McGinley said input received from principals was positive. Principals and School Improvement Councils would have decision making authority about making reductions. In response to Rev. Collins' concern about schools at risk, Mr. Fraser said they are excluded. Rev. Collins said he didn't want to eliminate Teacher Assistants. Mrs. Oplinger said some are required by

law. As former principal, she prefers the decision making ability. In response to Mrs. Taylor's question about Special Education funding, Mr. Bobby said those are protected positions. Mrs. Green agreed with Mrs. Oplinger about decisions being made at schools. However, she commented that this is a sad decision to have to make. Mrs. Moffly said the decision was awesome and the same thing charter schools do. Mr. Fraser said sad that tough decisions have to be made and he hopes the Board takes their role seriously because peoples' lives are affected. Mrs. Coats suggested that principals be held accountable if this is done.

Mrs. Oplinger moved, seconded by Mrs. Green approval of the recommendation for School Based Local Decision Making and Lump Sum Budgeting. The motion was approved 8-1 (Rev. Collins opposed).

6. **Small School Pairings:** (Total enrollment between 400-500 students) - Shared administration, classified staff and teachers.

- Frierson and Mt. Zion = 389
- Stono Park and Murray LaSaine = 503
- St. James-Santee and Lincoln = 356
- *Charleston Progressive Academy and North Charleston Creative Arts = 363
- Jane Edwards, Minnie Hughes, and CC Blaney = 481
- Morningside Excel and Arms = 439

Mr. Fraser asked this item be deferred until community meetings are held. No action taken.

7. **Alternatives to Substitutes:**

- Schools receive lump sum budget for substitute service and Principal and School Improvement Council decides how to handle substitute service.

Mrs. Oplinger moved, seconded by Mrs. Green approval of Alternatives to Substitutes. The motion was approved 9-0.

11.3: Calendar/Make Up Day

A. 2011-12 Calendar

Dr. Gepford addressed the Board regarding the Academic Calendar information regarding the process to use for next year's calendar. He compared the two calendars A/B. He said make-up days were built in. Input is being received through this week from stakeholders. Mrs. Kandrac asked if there were other options and how staff could determine if the same person voted multiple times. Dr. Rose suggested that was possible. Dr. Gepford said information would be received from the survey. Mrs. Kandrac requested a comment section be added. Mrs. Taylor said she heard the biggest piece is the high schools and figuring how to have exams before breaks. She said suggested petitioning of state legislature to change calendar. Dr. Gepford said the High Schools would like to calendar to go back the way it was.

B. Proposed Waiver Request (Inclement Weather 2010-11)

Dr. Gepford said regarding the snow day, 90% suggested a make-up day on March 21st. This is also recommendation of staff. Mrs. Moffly said it's a Board decision. Mr. Emerson said statute says the School Board would have to approve a recommendation to ask Legislative Delegation for permission to waive make up day. Mr. Fraser said the Board could approve it, subject to a waiver. Dr. Gepford said staff would like to have opportunity to provide instruction. Mrs. Kandrac requested the survey be redone to add third option - ask teachers what they think about waiving day. Mrs. Taylor spoke about the proposed law in legislature. She said from standpoint of teachers giving up third teacher workday to save nickels and dimes, one day will not change SAT or PASS scores

significantly.

Mrs. Moffly moved, Mrs. Kandrac, a waiver from the state for the inclement day. Dr. McGinley asked that the Board consider amending to make up on March 21 if waiver from state is denied. Mrs. Moffly and Mrs. Kandrac agreed to amend the motion. The motion approved 6-3 (Mrs. Green, Mrs. Oplinger and Mr. Fraser opposed).

11.4 Citizen's Advisory Board

Business Name	Submitted by	Individual Recommended
City of Charleston	Mayor Joseph Riley	Mr. Ed Fava
Town of Mt. Pleasant	Mayor William Swails	Dr. Mark Hartley
Charleston Metro Chamber	Ms. Mary Graham	Mr. Bret D. Johnson
City of North Charleston	Mayor Keith Summey	Ms. Amy D. Jowers
City of North Charleston	Mayor Keith Summey	Mr. Darbis Briggman

Mr. Fraser said a recommendation for other individuals to serve on the committee at-large will come before the Board for a vote at the next meeting. Mrs. Oplinger moved, seconded by Mrs. Green approval of the five individuals listed above to serve on the Citizen's Advisory Board. The motion was approved with a 7-2 (Mrs. Kandrac and Mrs. Moffly opposed).

Mr. Fraser also asked Rev. Collins to serve as the Board's Liaison on the committee. Rev. Collins accepted.

II. NEW BUSINESS

There being no more business to come before the Charleston County School District's Board of Trustees, at 7:40 p.m., Mr. Fraser adjourned the meeting.