

**I. EXECUTIVE SESSION**  
4:00 p.m.

A regular meeting of the Board of Trustees of the Charleston County School District was held on Monday, November 14, 2011, with the following members of the Board present: Mr. Chris Fraser - Chair, Rev. Chris Collins - Vice Chair, Mr. Craig Ascue, Mrs. Cindy Bohn Coats, Mrs. Toya Hampton-Green, Mrs. Elizabeth Kandrak, Mrs. Elizabeth Moffly, Mrs. Ann Oplinger, and Dr. Nancy J. McGinley, Superintendent and Executive Secretary. Mrs. Mary Ann Taylor was absent. Principal Benjamin Bragg of Cario Middle accompanied Dr. McGinley since he was shadowing her. Staff members Mr. Michael Bobby, Dr. Lisa Herring, Mrs. Audrey Lane, Dr. Brenda Nelson, Mr. William Lewis, Mrs. Melissa Matarazzo, Dr. Brenda Nelson, and Mr. Elliot Smalley were also in attendance.

The news media was duly notified of the meeting and representatives were present.

Chairman Fraser called the meeting of November 14, 2011 to order at 4:00 p.m. Rev. Collins moved, seconded by Mrs. Coats, to go into Executive Session to discuss agenda items listed below. The motion was approved unanimously.

- 1.1: *Student Transfer Appeals*
- 1.2: *Appointment – Principal – Lambs Elementary*
- 1.3: *District 23 Board Vacancy*
- 1.4: *District 4 Board Vacancy*
- 1.5: *Architectural Design Contract – Laing Middle & Jennie Moore Elementary*
- 1.6: *Architectural Design Contract – Wando Middle College*
- 1.7: *Personnel Matter*
- 1.8: *Student Appeal Decision – District 4 & Appeal hearing dates for others (3)*
- 1.9: *Appointment – Principal On Special Assignment*

**OPEN SESSION**

**II. CALL TO ORDER, INVOCATION/MOMENT OF SILENCE, & PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

Mr. Fraser called Open Session to Order at 5:30 p.m. with 8 of the 9 board members present. Mrs. Taylor was absent. Then Chairman Fraser led the group in a Moment of Silence followed by the Pledge of Allegiance.

**III. ADOPTION OF AGENDA**

Mrs. Green moved, seconded by Mrs. Oplinger, to adopt the agenda of November 14, 2011 with the following amendments: The motion was approved 6-2 (Kandrak and Moffly opposed).

Mrs. Kandrak asked the board to postpone approval of agenda item 10.1B - CCSD Solicitation B1205 District Food Safety and Sanitation. She said this would allow staff time to investigate and determine if the bid was handled properly. Mrs. Kandrak moved, seconded by Mrs. Moffly, to pull agenda item 10.1B CCSD Solicitation B1205 District Food Safety and Sanitation. The motion failed 5-3 (Collins, Kandrak and Moffly supported the motion).

Mr. Fraser moved, seconded by Mr. Ascue, to pull agenda item 10.2A - Health Advisory Committee Recommendation because the board did not receive HAC candidates resumes. The motion was approved 8-0.

Mrs. Kandrak moved the board pull agenda item 1.3 - District 23 Constituent Board Vacancy because information on all of the candidates that applied for the position weren't forwarded to the board. However, no one seconded the motion.

**3.1: Election of Board Officers**

In accordance to Board Policy BD, Organization of School Board and SC Code 1976, as amended, Section 59-19-70 Election of Officers, the board elected new officers. Mr. Fraser opened the floor for the nominations for Board Chair. Mrs. Oplinger nominated Mr. Fraser for the position of Board Chair,

Mrs. Green seconded the nomination. Mrs. Kandrak nominated Mrs. Moffly for the position of Board Chair, Mrs. Moffly seconded the nomination. The board approved the nomination for Mr. Fraser for the position of Board Chair with a vote of 6-2 (Kandrak & Moffly opposed). Since the nomination for Mr. Fraser was approved; no action was taken on the nomination for Mrs. Moffly to serve as chair.

Mrs. Moffly inquired about the policy regarding the appointment of Vice Chair stating that officers appointed after an election, such as Vice Chair, should not be elected annually. She referred to the Act of Consolidation and read from Board Policy BD – Organization of the School Board. After Mrs. Kandrak suggested it was wrong for Mr. Fraser to preside over his own vote for chair, she asked Mrs. Moffly to share information regarding Election of Officers. Mrs. Kandrak read a statement from Roberts Rules of Order, page 74 about the use of ballots and page 79 about election by ballot. Mr. Fraser said Mrs. Kandrak should have made a motion earlier to vote by ballot.

The motion to elect a vice chair vote was approved 5-3 (Collins, Kandrak and Moffly opposed). Mr. Fraser suggested policy BD should be discussed at next Policy Committee Meeting.

Mrs. Oplinger nominated Mr. Ascue for Vice Chair. However, Mr. Ascue respectfully declined. Mrs. Green nominated Mrs. Coats for Vice Chair, Mr. Ascue seconded the nomination. The motion was approved 5-3 (Collins, Kandrak, and Moffly opposed).

Mrs. Kandrak said regarding the position of Vice Chair, she read that vacancies could be filled by board and term for officers should be for one year and the term of the election for vice chairman is not mentioned. She said based on Policy BD, she insist that remain in the position of Vice Chair. She also said no motion was needed for Collins to remain in the position. After Mr. Fraser said his interpretation could be over-riden, Mrs. Kandrak moved, seconded by Mrs. Moffly to not elect a new vice chair and allow Rev. Collins to remain in the Vice Chair position. Since the previous motion was approved, the board did not vote on this motion.

#### **IV. SPECIAL RECOGNITIONS** *(20 minutes)*

##### **4.1: Recognition of Athletes**

Philanthropy Week – November 14<sup>th</sup>. All Philanthropic partners were thanked.

1. Coach Dave Spurlock introduced student athletes that competed in the following categories:
  - Wando HS Swimming Team - State Champions
  - Wando HS Girls Cross Country Team – State Champions
  - Wando Girls Tennis – State Runner Up
  - Players from Wando, WAHS Football North South Football Team Participants
  - Players from Wando HS, James Island Charter HS - Shrine Bowl
  - In 1978 Young man had a heat stroke, he pledged to do all he could to address those issues by having adequate trainers to help make this happen - Dr. Rod Schoderbeck and Ms. Danielle Green – athletic trainer who work at Roper St. Francis were recognized. Mr. Spurlock also thanked Michael Bobby and Ms. Terri Shannon for their assistance.
  - Danielle Green introduced 6 athletic trainers who work with the sports medicine program.
  - Dave Spurlock said these trainers are worth millions of dollars. He thanked Roper St. Francis Hospital and Dr. Schoderbeck, and Danielle Green and other trainers.
2. Amanda Fox, a support provider with Communities in Schools, was recognized for being recognized nationally as an Unsung Hero.

Mrs. Oplinger commented that she is fortunate to have Communities in School in CCSD schools.

#### **V. SUPERINTENDENT'S REPORT**

**Board requests** – Over the last few weeks, Board members have requested and been given information on—McGinley congratulated Jane Riley on upcoming wedding this Saturday.

- The outsourcing of Day Porters final payment;
- Transfers out of North Charleston schools;
- Garrett Academy Student Activity Funds;

- The 1:1 Learning Initiative (iPad Project);
- The fall Vision 2016 stakeholder meeting schedule—we'll continue our listening sessions with student, parent, and community stakeholder groups this week, beginning tomorrow with students and parents; and last week the board met with principals.
- A report on school plans for Veterans Day showing that all of schools took advantage of the makeup day to honor our veterans and teach students important lessons about sacrifice, courage, and duty to country.
- There was also a request for information on the 3<sup>rd</sup> and 6<sup>th</sup> Grade Academies—that will be presented tonight during the CAE presentation.

**Wando Band** – Congratulations to the Wando band for winning *STATE* last weekend for the last seven years, and making the Top 12 *NATIONALLY* this weekend at the grand nationals in Indianapolis. Wando was in the top 12 out of 92 bands that began competing on Thursday.

**Wellness Initiative developments...**

Dr. McGinley recently met MUSC's "Lean Team" to discuss the expansion of two initiatives that began last school year—the "Adopt a Physician" program through which doctors are assigned to specific schools, and the "CCSD Wellness Championship." The Wellness Championship is a district-wide contest that encourages school wellness committees to make concrete and lasting health-related improvements in their communities. These efforts—as well as last month's *Second Annual Employee Wellness Fair* for staff members and families—are all part of our ongoing emphasis on student and employee wellness.

**The District's Report Card** – was released Thursday. The report is the first-ever "Good" rating and new "Excellent" improvement rating. CCSD teachers, principals, parents/community partners, and staff all deserve recognition for this great accomplishment.

The progress, not just this year, but over time—In 2007, 44% of CCSD's students attended "Good" or "Excellent" schools. That number has GROWN to 55% this year. Even better, 38% of our students attended Below Average or At-Risk schools in 2007, and that number has DROPPED to 20% (*graphic will be displayed*). This was not a miracle, but a method and hard work. The Superintendent ended her report by thanking teachers and everyone who support students, teachers and school leaders.

Mrs. Kandrac asked Dr. McGinley about charter schools involvement in Veteran's Day activities. McGinley said CCSD does not direct activities of charter schools. Mrs. Kandrac also asked why charter schools weren't listed on flu shot schedule. McGinley said charters were notified and told to contact DHEC to schedule immunization day.

Mrs. Kandrac said she appreciate Student Achievement info and report card information. In 2010 the newspaper said there was a substantial decrease in scores and some schools were closed Some students were sent to other schools. She asked staff to identify which schools received those students. McGinley said Schroder Middle, McClellanville Middle, Charlestowne Academy, Fraser Elementary and Brentwood Middle.

Mrs. Kandrac also asked how abuse is reported in schools if something is suspected and if administrators should report incidents to administrators or the police. Dr. McGinley said all teachers, administrators, and bus drivers were trained by Darkness to Light two years ago. The district is required to contact DHEC is something is suspected. Teachers could go directly to the police and there is no question about responding to complaints. Mrs. Kandrac asked the superintendent to communicate this information in a letter to employees because she was told that in the past staff and teachers have been told not to tinker in day to day activities.

**VI. VISITORS, PUBLIC COMMUNICATIONS (Not to exceed 30 minutes)**

Rev. Collins read Policy BEDH regarding the Public Addressing the Board.

1. Ms. Ruth Truluck, Mr. Ron Jones, Mr. Patrick Bryan, Mr. Paul Gawrych, Mr. Brad Morrison, Ms. Beth Kerrigan, Mr. Ross Cary, Mr. Elton Carrier, Mr. Coby Mazingo, Ms. Liz Potter, Rebecca Imholz, Mr. Chris Star, Mr. Ed Graham, Howard Chalmers, Ms. E. C. Setser, Ms. Myra Jones, and Dr. Michele

- Killez addressed the board in support of the Wando Career and Technology Academy.
2. Mr. Jon Butzon expressed concerns about the proposed policy on board compensation. He said the timing was ill-advised. He urged board to consider an accurate assessment of all district employees and consider compensating employees first. In meantime, he asked them to answer the question "What value have you added to warrant such compensation?"
  3. Mr. Franklin Ashley addressed the board about the proposed board compensation policy. He proposed a compromise-- if the board compensation is approved, it should start with the next board; not the current board. And, the current board members should recuse themselves and consider doing something for the county as a whole.
  4. Mr. Bret Johnson, chairman of CCSD's Citizen Oversight Committee and Audit and Finance Committee Member addressed the board regarding the execution of one cent sales tax. He encouraged the Board to adhere to what voters approved. He said his concerns are outlined in letter provided to board prior to the meeting. He urged the board to continue with plans for Wando Middle College.
  5. Mr. Carlos Hernandez, a member of the Charleston Teacher Alliance, expressed concerns to the board regarding the Policy 6155 – Promotion Standards.
  6. Mr. Kent Riddle, a teacher at Angel Oak and chair of the Charleston Teacher Alliance, addressed the board regarding the proposed policy to increase compensation for Board members. He suggested that no pay raise should be considered until teachers get cost of living raise. He also asked about CTA data provided to staff and how the data would be used.
  7. Ms. Kate Darby, the School Improvement Council Chair at High commented on school accountability and transparency. She said there were two Blue Ribbon Committees and the recommendation was always to have a second high school.

At this time Mrs. Coats suggested the agenda be rearranged. Rev. Collins responded that the agenda had already been adopted.

## **VII. APPROVAL OF MINUTES/EXECUTIVE SESSION AGENDA ITEMS**

### **7.1: Open Session Minutes of October 10, 2011 & October 24, 2011**

#### **A. October 10, 2011**

Mrs. Coats moved, seconded by Mrs. Oplinger, approval of the Open Session Minutes of October 10, 2011. The motion was approved 7-1 (Kandrac opposed).

Mrs. Kandrac said page 7.1 at the bottom should read "Kandrac asked about the last person that was added to the Audit and Finance Committee".

#### **B. October 24, 2011**

Mrs. Coats moved, seconded by Mrs. Oplinger, approval of the Open Session Minutes of October 24, 2011. The motion was approved 8-0.

Mrs. Kandrac said page 7.1-6b at the top of the page in the Charleston Achieving Excellence Update should read the information she requested was never provided.

### **7.2: Motions of Executive Session of November 14, 2011**

#### **1.1: Student Transfer Appeals**

The Board approved four student transfer appeals approving student transfer appeals A,B & C and deny D due to lack of space. The vote was 8-0.

#### **1.2: Appointment – Principal – Lambs Elementary**

The Board approved the appointment of Ms. Jarmalar Logan to serve as principal at Lambs Elementary. The vote was 8-0.

#### **1.3: District 23 Board Vacancy**

The Board approved a motion to defer the St. Paul Constrict District 23 Board of Trustees appointment until November 28<sup>th</sup>.

#### **1.4: District 4 Board Vacancy**

The Board approved a motion appointing Ms. Lisa Brown-Twun to serve on the Cooper River Constrict District 4Board of Trustees. The vote was 6-2 (Kandrac and Moffly opposed).

**1.5: Architectural Design Contract – Laing Middle & Jennie Moore Elementary**

The Board approved a recommendation allowing staff to enter into a contract with Jumper Carter Sease Architects to provide architectural services for Laing Middle School and Jennie Moore Elementary School through Construction Closeout, in the amount of \$2,906,525.00. This project is funded by the one (1) cent sales tax revenues. The vote was 8-0.

**1.6: Architectural Design Contract - Wando Middle College**

The Board approved a recommendation allowing staff to enter into a contract with LS3P Associates, Ltd. To provide architectural services for Wando Middle College from, recently completed, Design Development Phase through Construction Closeout, in the amount of \$1,840,778.00. This project is funded by the one (1) cent sales tax revenues. The vote was approved 6-2 (Kandrac and Moffly opposed).

Mrs. Kandrac expressed concerns about the location and over-crowding. Also she said the board is scheduled to vote on the Middle College. However, the signs displayed by folks in the audience read Career and Technology Center. She said a film and media program is already offered at Trident Tech. Then she asked if students would get a degree. Mrs. Kandrac addressed someone in audience who responded to a comment Mrs. Kandrac made earlier about Long Island stating they should raise their hand first to be recognized, prior to speaking. Mrs. Kandrac concluded that she would not support the Wando Middle College recommendation.

Rev. Collins said he would support the school the taxpayers voted for. However, the middle college should build large enough to accommodate additional students in the future, since the town is growing. He suggested staff find money for bigger school.

Mrs. Moffly stated the community was promised a second high school since 1998. She referred to it as a "bait and switch" strategy. Then she said they were told they would get a second high school, at the old Wando site, after first one was built. Key communicators did a survey which resulted in everyone wanting a second high school. She said \$49.7 million is built in for second high school for students to receive elective credits.

Mr. Ascue said Wando Middle College is a good project and the public has spoken.

**1.7: Personnel Matter**

1. The Board approved a Resolution for Day Porter Compensation, at approximately \$70-\$80,000.00. The funding source is General Operating funds. The motion was approved 8-0.
2. The Board approved a salary recommendation crediting certified veterans. The funding source is General Operating Funds and the amount is \$34,954.79.

At 7:08 p.m., the board took 5 minute recess and reconvened at 7:13 p.m.

**1.8: Student Appeal Decision – District 4 & Appeal hearing dates for others (3)**

The Board approved a recommendation overturning the District 4 Constituent Board's expulsion decision, placing the student on long term removal for the remainder of the first semester. Student must re-appear before the board prior to second semester – Wednesday, January 11, 2011 at 10:00am with proof and documentation (court order and all evaluation as it pertains to education and interaction with others) to be considered for re-admittance at Liberty Hill Academy on a level system or returned to his home school. Student must also continue family psychological examinations and is prohibited from being on CSD school campuses or attending CCSD sponsored functions. The vote was 8-0.

Also, the Board agreed to hear two student appeals on Tuesday, November 29<sup>th</sup> starting at 8:30.

**1.9: Appointment - Principal On Special Assignment**

The Board approved the appointment of Ms. LaTisha Vaughan-Brandon to serve as Principal on Special Assignment in the Innovation Zone Learning Community. The vote was 6-2 (Kandrac and Moffly opposed).

### **7.3: Financial Minutes of October 24, 2011**

Mrs. Oplinger moved, seconded by Mrs. Coats, approval of the Financial Minutes of October 24, 2011. The motion was approved 8-0.

Mrs. Moffly said 11.2 grants, associated with financial minutes, was not listed. Mr. Bobby responded that the amount is the split between total and district's share was only amount reported. He said he could bring documentation of matching grants they bring to the table. Mrs. Coats added that other funds come from non-CCSD sources. She also asked for the financial minutes for item 11.1 and if future impact amount was accurate. Mr. Bobby said it was. Mrs. Moffly asked where other amount came from. Mr. Bobby said he would bring information back because he didn't have it with him.

## **VIII. CAE UPDATE**

### **8.1: 3<sup>rd</sup> & 6<sup>th</sup> Grade Academies – Mrs. Melissa Matarazzo, Mrs. Christine Ryan & Mrs. Gwendolyn Benton**

Mrs. Melissa Metarazzo, Mrs. Christine Ryan, and Mrs. Gwendolyn Benton presented information to the board on 3<sup>rd</sup> and 6<sup>th</sup> Grade Academies. The handouts that were provided to the board respond to questions the board asked earlier about the Academies. Information on goals, explanation of terms (MAP, National Percentile Rank and Tier 1, 2, & 3) and Results were also highlighted.

Both 3<sup>rd</sup> and 6<sup>th</sup> Grade Academies –

Mrs. Ryan said 3<sup>rd</sup> Grade Academies are 15:1 ratio. Associate teachers have done a good. 3<sup>rd</sup> grade students are monitored and benchmarked. Mary Ann Dieter in the Title I Program provides assistance to her in this program.

Mrs. Benton, the 6<sup>th</sup> Grade Instructional Specialist said results show a decline in students in tier three and lowest 10% in math. There are 8 different sites-- Morningside has two sites, Blaney, James Island Middle, Laing Middle, Northwoods Middle, West Ashley Middle, Zucker Middle. Enrollment went down this year. She spoke about services beyond district requirement and program adjustments due to shortage of funds.

Mrs. Metarazzo said continued support for Literacy Academies would help close the achievement gap.

Rev. Collins asked if the district is spending less money for 6<sup>th</sup> Grade. Mrs. Metarazzo and Dr. McGinley responded that program was decentralized and placed in middle schools in district to eliminate transportation, principal position, and other things and saved over a million dollars.

Collins said more progress was made in 3rd Grade. Then he suggested more money be sought to address 6<sup>th</sup> grade issues. Mrs. Metarazzo said Mr. Martin could address other services provided.

Mrs. Moffly asked about Title I funding and said district sets bar. The number is 30 but board could do something different. Dr. McGinley said 75% is what that state says but district goes beyond that and drops it down to 70%. She said if it goes lower, there would be less funding going to neediest schools. Moffly said she would like to see more reading teachers with first graders. Mrs. Terri Nichols said all Kindergarten, 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> grade teachers are required to have literacy certification. Although some are grandfathered in, they have time to get certified.

Mrs. Oplinger commented that she is happy to see support for fourth graders and she said additional support for fifth graders should make a difference. Test results are positive and efforts need to be in place prior to developing the budget.

Rev. Collins asked what 3<sup>rd</sup> Grade Academy teachers teach. Mrs. Ryan replied, they teach everything and she share information about their certification. Rev. Collins asked about 6<sup>th</sup> Grade Academies and Mrs. Benton responded. Collins asked how to get kids going to seventh grade up to par without the drastic cost. Dr. Winbush said when they dis-banned 6<sup>th</sup> grade academy some resources followed them. He spoke about schools creatively addressing interventions.

Mr. Ascue said he agreed with Rev. Collins suggestion to focus on 6<sup>th</sup> Grade Academy and will willing support funds for it. Ascue asked about family involvement and Mrs. Benton said she was not with the program prior to September. However, Dr. Winbush said parents were involved. Ascue suggested there should be more students in that program. Benton said some 6<sup>th</sup> Grade Academy Schools are not Title I schools and those schools have less funds.

Mrs. Kandrak said the group did nice job on the presentation. Then, she asked about 2011 results for the St Andrews program. Benton said there wasn't a program last year. It started this year.

Mrs. Matarazzo addressed scores of students who went to 7<sup>th</sup> grade, adolescent changes, and social/emotional changes and finding a way to better support growth after 6<sup>th</sup> grade academy. Dr. Winbush said biggest problem was that parents would not send kids to summer program. Now it has been decentralized, more kids may be involved. He asked board to stand behind mandatory attendance.

## **IX. MANAGEMENT REPORT(S)**

Mr. Bobby said gains in Student Achievement will need to continue to be supported and expanded. Then he shared his plans to be more conservative.

### **9.1: Capital Projects Report of August 2011**

The Board received the Capital Projects Report of August 2011 as information. No action was taken.

Mr. Bobby said expending \$1.7 million one month spending and another spending \$756,000. Last two Rivers and Sullivan's Island projects identified in 2005 program. He said his hope is that money would be left over. In response to Rev. Collins' question about using funds for North Charleston High, Bobby said fund must be used for projects in the program. Collins asked about procedures to move money. Bobby said board would have an opportunity to expand on programs already in the projects or consider taking money to reduce the payment term, debt burden and interest. However, the district is a number of years away from making those type decisions. Staff will bring some information forward in 2-3 months after meeting with CEEF.

Mrs. Kandrak suggested other board members consider calling in or sit in at Policy or Audit & Finance meeting to get their questions answered beforehand. She also asked what it would take to get a tape player to record meeting. Mr. Bobby said that is a question for the board. Mrs. Kandrak said she would put on policy or Audit committee agenda.

### **9.2: Capital Projects Report – September 2011**

The Board received the Capital Projects Report of September 2011 as information. No action was taken. Financial data to support sales tax was provided in the report and the district is slightly running behind projected amount. He cautioned the board not to get overly excited at this point.

### **9.3: 2012 1st Quarter Report of Small, Women Minority Business Enterprise**

The Board received the 2012 1<sup>st</sup> Quarter Report of Minority Business Enterprise/Small, Women Minority Business Enterprise activity as part of the CCSD MBE Utilization plan. No action was taken.

Mr. Bobby said the two changes were made. There are two new categories as requested

earlier by the board. This would be the norm for future reports. Mr. Feil said total number of vendors were broken down by type.

**9.4: 4th Quarter Charleston County School District Budget Report & District Fiscal Condition**

The Board received the 4<sup>th</sup> Quarter Charleston County District Budget Report & District Fiscal Condition Report as information. No action was taken.

Mr. Bobby shared a PowerPoint presentation. He said small group meetings would be needed to review information later. He highlighted:

- Historical/Projected
- Sustainability & District Fiscal Condition
- Recommendation to come 11/28/11
- Decline of State Funding--Hold Harmless funds are no longer available.
- Act 388 - cap on local school districts....
- Local property tax has grown.
- CCSD generates highest mill in state. Charleston County has 2<sup>nd</sup> lowest tax burden in the state.
- Delinquent Tax collection has provided significant tax revenues.
- CCSD board asked staff to seek a sustainable fiscal management model. Theory of Action was shared with the Board. Mr. Bobby said additional revenues must be sought. In addition to \$1.5 billion dollars in district assets, expansion and additional resources will be required. Additional resources would be required to maintain additional square footage.
- The General Fund has not increased year to year
- Must pay attention to the enrollment trends which is increasing and generates an increased cost. The amount received from state does not cover half the cost.
- Must have best people, facilities
- Non Sustainable funds-E-rate, state stabilization, fund balance, EFA information was reviewed
- Enrollment projections, 3 years since cost of living increase, two years without step increase.
- Fund balance is a little over 8% so the district has the ability to absorb one month of operational expense.
- Staff is looking at strategies to improve the district's credit rating. That would mean ongoing savings and interest as issue debts in future.
- Fiscal health is improving.
- **Recommendation:** Consider Loyalty stipend on 11/28/11--hold firm on expenditures from unallocated fund balance (balance of Current FY12)Receive Fiscal Condition Projections (Dec 2011) including
  - Tax Incentive Finance Revenue
  - Tax Revenue Projected
  - Impact of Reassessment
  - Projected Expenditure Increases
- A Loyalty Stipend that would be a one-time amount of \$500 per person to 5,500 employees prior to winter break. Mrs. Kandrac asked if outsourced personnel were included. Mr. Bobby said no. However, he was willing to talk about it.

Mr. Bobby said he is pleased with the report cards and fiscal condition improving at an economically difficult time and fund balance is higher than it has been in some time.

Mr. Ascue said staff has done a good job. He said school board business is different and staff has focused on academics and fund balance and now over 5% policy during a bad economy. Rev. Collins and Mr. Fraser also commended staff for doing a good job.

Mrs. Coats said Mr. Bobby presented the possibility of a fall bonus to the Audit and Finance



Committee.

**9.5: Interim Financial Report – June 2011**

The Board received the Interim Financial Report of June 2011 for the General Operating Fund and Special Revenue Funds as information. No action was taken.

**9.6: Update on School Capacity**

The Board received an Update on School Capacity. No action was taken.

Mr. Bobby presented the School Capacity Report in response to a Board request to illustrate how capacity of a school is impacted as a part of the Voluntary Transfer Process. The report included defined Voluntary Transfers, Programs, and Enrollment Projections. Mr. Bobby informed the board that continuation of current voluntary transfers will generate uncontrolled decisions that create additional operational costs to accommodate transfers. A board workshop was recommended to allow staff to review the calculation methodology with the board. Staff is close to having the information ready and had 10 more schools to go. He requested the board identify focus time for the data. He said using numbers to make decisions would lead to bad decisions. It is necessary to look at capacity by grade level and other information. Also, he said No Child Left Behind transfers, Voluntary transfers, and Magnet transfers impact the numbers.

Mrs. Moffly suggested it was necessary to find way to keep current and accurate. Mr. Bobby agreed.

Dr. McGinley said a lot of work has been done and staff needs time to elaborate on the details before sharing with board. Mr. Bobby said time was also needed to share this information with board.

**X. COMMITTEE REPORT(S)**

**10.1: Audit & Finance Committee**

**A. Garrett Academy of Technology & Septima Clark Restroom Renovations**

On behalf of the Audit and Finance Committee, Mrs. Coats moved approval of the recommendation to award the contract for Septima Clark Corporate Academy – Group Restrooms to Emory J. Infinger in the amount of \$211,000.00 and Garrett Academy of Technology – Group Restroom to Metro Contracting, Inc. in the amount of \$408,408.00. The funding source is re-allocation of Capital Building Funds from the 2005 approved by the Board November 8, 2010 available for the Garrett project. And, Qualified School Construction Bond project funds for the Septima Clark project. The motion was approved 8-0.

**B. CCSD Solicitation B1205 District Food Safety and Sanitation**

On behalf of the Audit and Finance Committee, Mrs. Coats moved approval of the recommendation to award the contract to the low bidder PortionPac Chemical, at \$72,199.90 per year or \$101.69 per school per month. The funding source is CCSD Food Service Annual Budget. The motion was approved 5-3 (Collins, Kandrak and Moffly opposed).

Mrs. Kandrak expressed concerns about the bid after sharing information from emails she received. She said one writer wrote that one said no time allotted for vendors to rewrite bids. Mrs. Coats said the company who filed complaint had submitted bids in previous years. Mr. Fred Feil said during bid process they went back to the former method of reporting costs. Solicitation was broken down to labor and supplies. Since the amendment was sent two days earlier, vendors had all the information they needed. Also, the vendor who filed the complaint was already providing information to the district in the same format.

Mrs. Kandrak asked if the addendum was posted like the bid. Mr. Feil said vendors were contacted, individually. Mrs. Kandrak asked if the addendum should have been posted. Mr. Feil said since staff didn't receive any using the old format, staff determined that it was not required. Mrs. Kandrak stated that someone reported that they had only two hours to get the work done prior to deadline because they were on the road. Mr. Feil said the vendor

showed up. Also, Feil said he responded to the Freedom of Information Request Mrs. Kandrak mentioned. Mrs. Kandrak said although the company paid for FOIA, they have not received the information. Feil said could not release the response prior to the awarding of the contract.

Rev. Collins asked about reissuing bid. Mr. Feil said some vendors met the deadline. Collins said it is a hard call since there is only \$5,000 difference in the cost. Feil said vendors had the opportunity to ask for more time. However, no one requested more time. Mrs. Coats said complaint came after they realized they didn't win bid.

Mrs. Moffly asked about appeals process. Mr. Feil outlined steps and said protest solicitation or amendments are sent to him. If vendors are not satisfied, they could protest to the district panel. They person complaining did not file appeal within appropriate time frame. Moffly asked about appeals committee. Feil said they haven't received a protest and they've only been five protests in five years.

Mrs. Kandrak read more information from the email about the behavior of CCSD employees and said it should be investigated and questions about reviewed by those who solicited bids. She commented that it looked like the "fox is guarding hen house". Feil said he was not actively involved since he monitors protests.

Mrs. Moffly asked if board members were involved in the process. Feil said the process is outlined on document provided. The protestor has 15 days to protest solicitation or 10 days to protest appeals. He said protest was submitted to him 10 days after the deadline.

Mrs. Moffly said she did math and it didn't appear to be beyond deadline. Feil said he replied to an email he received. The closing and bid was on 31<sup>st</sup>. Moffly said email sent was September 12<sup>th</sup>. Feil said it was not done appropriately according to the code. The vendor was asked to submit it in writing. Moffly ask if email was valid. Feil said it was not an appropriate protest.

Mrs. Kandrak said she had another email dated August 22<sup>nd</sup> regarding Mr. Lewis' office being contacted. Then Mrs. Kandrak called for a point of order citing that other board members are speaking over her. She suggested board members view tape to verify the same. She went on to say it should have been audited. Mr. Bobby responded, stating that pursuant to the issuance of bids, this was the incumbent that had previously billed the district. One quick email to Mr. Feil would have gotten Feil's attention. The protest was not valid. A Procurement Audit is done annually. Mrs. Green added that this was discussed at the Audit and Finance meeting last week and is discussed tonight. At this time, she suggested chair call for vote. Mr. Bobby said the vendor hasn't protested at the second level. They have option to appeal further.

**10.2: Policy Committee**

**A. Health Advisory Committee Recommendation (Volunteers)**

On behalf of the Policy Committee, Mrs. Moffly moved approval of the following HAC committee candidates. However, after discussion, this item was pulled ant it was determined that this item would be placed on the November 28<sup>th</sup> agenda.

Category	Name
Faith	Ted McNabb
	Will Klauber
	Henry Goodman
Parent	Kristine S. Wachsmuth
	Daniel Lovasz
Medical	Alfons J. Schirduan
	Kathy G. Moock

<b>Community</b>	Louise B. Anderson
	Louis Yuhasz
<b>Teacher</b>	Ashley Denby-Standafer
	Linda Dilgren

**B. First Reading – Responsible School Management**

On behalf of the Policy Committee, Mrs. Moffly moved approval of the First Reading of the Responsible School Management policy. However, after discussion, Chairman Fraser suggested the policy be returned to the Policy Committee to resubmit with the original policy for comparison reasons.

**C. First Reading - Policy BEDB – Agenda**

On behalf of the Policy Committee, Mrs. Moffly moved approval of the First Reading of Policy BEDB - Agenda. The motion failed with a 5-3 vote (Collins, Kandrac and Moffly supported the motion).

Mrs. Moffly said the revision clarifies deadline for agenda. She said the intent is to eliminate revisions with Friday Updates, unless there is an emergency. Dr. McGinley said staff needs to adhere to deadline. However, if there is an emergency, i.e., appointment of principal, she would like the board consider time sensitive items.

Mr. Fraser said the idea of going from six months to three months to revisit agenda items and having four members sit in on agenda review does not make sense.

**D. First Reading - Policy JH – Student Absences and Excuses**

On behalf of the Policy Committee, Mrs. Moffly moved approval of the First Reading of Policy JH – Student Absences and Excuses. Mr. Fraser suggested the policy be returned to the Policy Committee since a redline copy was not attached. Dr. McGinley said staff had a number of issues with the proposed policy. Staff is checking against state code to make sure consistent with it and getting input from principals. Mrs. Moffly said most codes are in existing policy and she added the part about High Schools That Work. She rewrote because it said seat time is not mandatory and she felt it was an important part of state law that had been neglected.

**E. First Reading – Policy BID – Board Member Compensation and Expenses**

On behalf of the Policy Committee, Mrs. Moffly moved approval of the First Reading of Policy BID – Board Member Compensation and Expenses. The motion was failed 6-3 (Collins, Kandrac and Moffly supported the motion).

Mrs. Oplinger asked why the redline version was not included. Mrs. Moffly said she printed out ACT 340 regarding compensation for board members as it relates to local officers. CCSD is largest in state with largest budget. She mentioned district’s budget and building program and said the board oversees over a billion dollars.

Mr. Ascue said as CEO of his own business and he knows he has to be careful. He was a constituent member receiving \$25 and at meetings until midnight. He said the board had to be careful about spending taxpayer’s money. He suggested it go on a referendum be placed on the ballot at election time to allow the voters to say what they want.

Mrs. Moffly said most elected official are compensated for their work. County Council gets \$15,000. She said there are many who feel CCSD board is under-compensated. She said good people won’t run because of amount. She said per diem went from \$10 to \$25 and also, board should only receive .09 cents per mile. She suggested placing the superintendent’s salary on a referendum. She said board should vote for those who come on the board in the future because some may not be able to volunteer for free. She serves on the board because she is passionate. She concluded “the board gets what it pays for”.

Rev. Collins said he serves the children in CCSD. He read from Act of Consolidation 1967 stating per diem amount of \$10 in 1967—44 years ago. Also, it says not more than 20 meetings and 9 cents per mile. He said gas was cheaper then. Now gas is \$3.30 a gallon.

Board members receive .50 cents a mile. He said the additional money would replenish money board members spend to visit schools across the county and allow board members to serve their constituent appropriately, maintain their vehicles and close the gap. He concluded that it shouldn't be a burden for individuals to serve the school district.

Mr. Ascue suggested it was necessary to compensate employees first. He agreed there are many who have good input and want to serve but cannot afford it. The Policy Committee should look at other compensations. The committee went to ceiling when they should have started from bottom.

Mrs. Coats said any action is three years from now. The committee should have discussed this issue with the full board before releasing it. The priority should be somewhere else now.

Rev. Collins asked how he got on front page when he didn't know about it. He said no one should be afraid to ask for compensation. Collins said the proposal will not changing the per diem amount. However, it would cover fuel cost and maybe a meal. After the board voted on the First Reading – Policy BID – Board Member Compensation and Expenses, Rev. Collins said the vote was not done appropriately. He suggested a workshop be held to further discuss this matter. . Mr. Fraser said he wouldn't support a workshop for this purpose.

## **XI. POTENTIAL CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS**

### **11.1: Visiting International Faculty**

Mrs. Coats moved on behalf of the Audit and Finance Committee approval of recommendation for the Visiting International Faculty payment of \$115,610.20 as invoiced to provide for the services of 10 Visiting International Faculty teachers in 6 CCSD Schools for the 2011-2012 school year. The motion was approved 6-2 (Kandrach and Moffly opposed).

### **11.2: Contractual Approval – SIG – Technology Project Manager**

Mrs. Oplinger moved, seconded by Mr. Ascue, approval of the recommendation for Contractual Services in an amount not to exceed \$116,690 funded by the School Improvement Grant (awarded to Burke, Stall and St. Johns High Schools) to pay for services of a Technology Project Manager to manage the technology and professional development of the 1-to-1 technology initiative. Contracted services will begin at date of hire and end September 30, 2012. The motion was approved 8-0.

Mr. Martin reported that last spring, when he and McCarron wrote grant, it was determined that the district did not have the staff needed to get program up and running this year.

### **11.3: Applicant Assessment Tool Request**

On behalf of the Audit and Finance Committee, Mrs. Coats moved approval of recommendation to allow the district to begin the Request for Proposal process to select an Assessment Tool that could be used in conjunction with the new Applicant Tracking System. The funding source would be GOF reallocation of savings from the new Applicant Tracking System to replace Ceridian. The motion was approved 8-0.

### **11.4: Upfit for the McNair Campus as a Swing Campus for Chicora Elementary School**

On behalf of the Audit and Finance Committee, Mrs. Coats moved approval of the Upfit for the McNair Campus as a Swing Campus for Chicora Elementary School. The cost of this project is not to exceed \$700,000. The funding source is proposed to be reallocated from previously approved Chicora Capital Project. The motion was approved 7-1 (Moffly opposed).

## **XII. NEW BUSINESS**

1. Mrs. Kandrach requested one or two tape recorders and streamlining of agenda because board meetings shouldn't last more than two hours.

There being no other information to come before the board, the meeting adjourned by consensus at 10:16pm.