

OPEN SESSION

A regular meeting of the Board of Trustees of the Charleston County School District was held on Monday, November 11, 2013, in the Board Room at 75 Calhoun Street with the following members of the Board present: Mrs. Cindy Bohn Coats – Chair, Mr. Tom Ducker - Vice Chair, Mr. Craig Ascue, Rev. Chris Collins, Mr. Chris Fraser, Mr. Todd Garrett, Mr. Michael Miller, Mrs. Elizabeth Moffly, and Dr. Nancy J. McGinley, Superintendent and Executive Secretary. Mr. John Barter was absent.

Staff members Mr. Michael Bobby, Mr. Bill Briggman, Mr. John Emerson, Mrs. Michele English Watson, Dr. Lisa Herring, Mrs. Anita Huggins, Mrs. Audrey Lane, Mr. Bill Lewis, Mr. Louis Martin, Mr. John McCarron, Dr. Brenda Nelson, Mrs. Terri Nichols, Mr. Paul Padron, Mrs. Erica Taylor, Mrs. Latisha Vaughn-Brandon, and Dr. James Winbush were also in attendance.

The news media was duly notified of the meeting and representatives were present.

At 5:00 p.m., Mrs. Coats called the meeting to order. Mr. Fraser moved, seconded by Mr. Miller, to go in executive session to discuss agenda items listed below. The motion was approved by consensus.

0.5: Election of Officers

Mr. Fraser nominated Mrs. Coats for the position of Chair, seconded by Mr. Ascue. The vote was 6-2 (Collins and Moffly opposed).

Mr. Ascue nominated Mr. Ducker for the position of Vice Chair, seconded by Mr. Garrett. The vote was 5-2-0 (Ducker and Moffly abstained). Mrs. Coats asked Mr. Ducker to verify his abstention vote. Mr. Ducker confirmed.

At 4:35 p.m., Mr. Fraser moved, seconded by Mr. Miller, to go in executive session to discuss agenda items listed below. The motion was approved by consensus.

I. EXECUTIVE SESSION

1.1: Student Transfer Appeals

1.2: Personnel Matter – Dr. Nancy McGinley, Superintendent of Schools

1.3: Workers Comp Regulation – Mr. Michael Bobby, Chief Financial & Operations Officer

1.4: Legal Update – Mr. John Emerson, General Counsel

OPEN SESSION

II. CALL TO ORDER, INVOCATION/MOMENT OF SILENCE, & PLEDGE of ALLEGIANCE

The Board reconvened in Open Session at 5:35 p.m. with seven Board members present. Note: Mr. Fraser left the meeting immediately after Executive Session--before the Board reconvened in Open Session.

Before calling for a Moment of Silence followed by the Pledge of Allegiance Mrs. Coats announced the passing of former Board member Mr. John Graham Altman. A photograph of Mr. Altman is on display on the table in the back of the board room to commemorate the loss of the former board member that served on the CCSD Board of Trustees for twenty years.

Mr. Ducker reminded everyone that today is Veteran's Day, a day to remember the contributions of all veterans that served in the armed forces.

III. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

Mr. Garrett moved, seconded by Mr. Miller, to adopt the November 11, 2013 Board agenda. The motion was approved 8-0.

IV. SPECIAL RECOGNITIONS– Mrs. Erica Taylor, Executive Director of Strategy & Communications

A. Proclamation – School Psychologist Week

Mrs. Erica Taylor read the proclamation in honor of National School Psychology Week. School psychologists were recognized for their dedication to the profession and the students they serve.

B. South Carolina Council of Social Studies Recognition

The Board recognized Ms. Ashley Newton from Hunley Park Elementary, Ms. Gerilyn Leland from Cario Middle,

and Ms. Ann Rustin from West Ashley High, for receiving the Palmetto Teacher of Distinction Award for Excellence in social studies instruction at the district level. Ms. Donna Croft was also recognized for receiving the State Teacher of Excellence Award last year.

V. SUPERINTENDENT'S REPORT – Dr. Nancy J. McGinley – Superintendent of Schools

Dr. McGinley reported the following:

- The Social Studies Teachers and School Psychologists recognized earlier were commended for their services.
- CCSD teachers and students recognized veterans that served in the armed forces in many ways — luncheons, programs, etc. The following Veterans and family members of veterans in the audience were recognized--board members Mr. Chris Fraser (absent), Mr. Tom Ducker and Mr. Todd Garrett and staff members Mr. Bill Lewis, Dr. James Winbush, Mr. Ron Kramps, Mr. Louis Martin, Mr. Paul Padron, Mr. Jeff Scott, and Mr. John Lowe and other veterans and attendees with family members of veterans who have served or are currently serving in the armed forces--Mrs. Erica Taylor. Rev. Collins said his father is also a veteran.
- Last Friday the district received the 2013 report card ratings. In 2011 there were 55.9% students attending Good/Excellent schools. In 2012 it increased to 57.1% and in 2013 there were 58%. Currently there are only four at risk schools, down from 23 seven or eight years ago. The district intends to continue making progress until the at-risk category is down to zero. The district will continue to build on this progress. The work is led by principals, teachers and others. In four years the graduation rate has risen from 67% to 76.9%. Dr. McGinley also offered board members a poster listing all of the national accomplishments of the district. In 2007, 53% of CCSD's schools were rated at-risk or below-average. Now that is down to 18%.

While this is positive news, the district still has a lingering achievement gap across student groups and a system that tells a tale of two cities. The team—tier of leaders that led the work were recognized for the progress the district made.

Mr. Miller commended Dr. Winbush for speaking at a Veteran's Day program at Military Magnet. While he was unable to attend the event he heard that Dr. Winbush did a fabulous job.

Mr. Ascue congratulated Dr. McGinley staff for their hard work which resulted in significant Report Card gains. He said too often folks talk about what the district is not doing. He suggested that cooperative efforts from everyone could move the four at-risk schools out of that category.

At this time Mrs. Coats congratulated Mr. Ducker who was voted in earlier as the new Board Vice Chair.

VI. VISITORS, PUBLIC COMMUNICATIONS

1. Mr. Mohammed Idris expressed concerns about holiday celebrations and the promotion of Santa Claus in CCSD Schools which he suggested was a misconception contributed to African Americans serving time in jail.
2. Mr. David Ward, the father of a Special Needs student at St. Andrews Middle, expressed concerns about charter schools and services his son was deprived of at the Charleston School of Math & Science Charter School.
3. Ms. Katy Kuder, president of the St. Andrews Middle PTA, addressed the Board about services provided at CCSD schools and expressed her support for the merging of St. Andrews MS and West Ashley MS.

VII. APPROVAL OF MINUTES/EXECUTIVE SESSION AGENDA ITEMS

7.1: Open Session Minutes of October 28, 2013

Mr. Ducker moved, seconded by Mr. Garrett, to approve the October 28, 2013 open session minutes. The vote was 7-0.

7.2: Executive Session Action Items of November 11, 2013

The Board voted on executive session action items of November 11, 2013.

1.1: Student Transfer Appeals

Mr. Ascue moved, seconded by Rev. Collins, to deny student appeal A and approve student appeal B, and delay action on student appeal C until November 25th to request the cost the district would incur if the Board approved this request. The vote was 7-0.

1.2: Personnel Matter – Dr. Nancy McGinley, Superintendent of Schools

Mr. Miller moved, seconded by Mr. Ascue, to approve the superintendent's recommendation to change the grade of the Deputy for Human Capital Development with a negotiated salary for the 2013-14 school year. Further, the salary will be based on the approved salary schedule retroactive to April 1,

2013.

Mr. Ducker offered a friendly amendment to delay the decision to change the grade of the Deputy of Human Capital Development until Nov. 25th due to funding issue, seconded by Mrs. Moffly. However, Mr. Garrett clarified that the delay would only be to seek information on the funding source. Mr. Ascue said he would accept the amendment with the provision of having all funds possibly come from the Teacher Incentive Fund (TIF) grant. The vote was 5-2 (Coats and Moffly opposed).

Mr. Ducker asked the superintendent to bring a status update to the Board on the funding at the next meeting or as soon as possible. Dr. McGinley said it may require input from the Federal Government.

Mr. Garrett asked when the full salary study would be presented to the Board. Mr. Bobby said that it was delayed for one meeting to allow more time to consider the recommendation. Mr. Ducker requested a report come before the Board on December 9th. Mrs. Coats asked staff to bring the report as soon as possible.

1.3: Workers Comp Regulation – Mr. Michael Bobby, Chief Financial & Operations Officer

The Board received information on the Workers' Comp Regulation. No action was taken.

1.4: Legal Update – Mr. John Emerson, General Counsel

The Board received a legal update from General Counsel.

7.3: A. Financial Minutes of October 14, 2013

Mr. Ascue moved, seconded by Mrs. Coats, to approve the October 14, 2013 financial minutes. The vote was 7-0.

Mr. Ascue asked about the site package and land clearing under agenda item 7.3A (10.1A). He suggested staff list the work where there is a statement that says "see an additional document." Mr. Bobby said the minutes would be amended once the contract is awarded. The Board gave staff authority on a time sensitive item and should be happy with results.

B. Financial Minutes of October 28, 2013

Mr. Garrett moved, seconded by Mr. Miller, to approve the October 28, 2013 financial minutes. The vote was 7-0.

VIII. CAE UPDATE(S)

There were no Charleston Achieving Excellence Updates to come before the Board at this meeting.

IX. MANAGEMENT REPORT(S)

There were no Management Reports to come before the Board at this meeting.

X. COMMITTEE REPORT(S)

10.1: Audit & Finance Committee – Mr. John Barter

A. Selection & Award of Facility Assessment Contractor – Mr. Michael Bobby, Chief Financial & Operations Officer

Mr. Garrett moved, seconded by Mrs. Moffly, to approve the recommendation to select and award contracts to three firms, Alpha Facilities Solutions, Heery International, and Cumming Corporation to perform comprehensive maintenance facility assessments of CCSD schools. The funding source is Fixed Cost of Ownership funds in the amount of \$700,000. The vote was 7-0.

Mr. Ascue asked if the service had been procured yet. Mr. Bobby said it went through the procurement process. Now they are evaluating the two submitters carefully before making a decision to award a contract within the approved budgeted amount. The final elements of the decision will be reflected in a future Board Financial Report. Mr. Bobby said the Procurement Office was involved from the time they started putting the procurement part together. Mr. Ronald Kramps said two proposals came in, Alpha and Heery came as a joint venture. Mr. Ascue asked if the joint venture included the minority factor. Mr. Kramps said he would investigate and get the answer. Mr. Garrett said they are looking at the 10% requirement for people/12% requirement for money for Small and Minority Businesses.

Mr. Ducker asked about exceptions to the assessment. Mr. Kramps said those that are slated for demolition would not be assessed. Mr. Kramps said he would provide a list of those on the list for demolition.

Mrs. Moffly said the Board asked for a list of all properties in the district but it has not been received to date.

Mrs. Coats asked if this information would come back to the Board when awarded. Mr. Bobby said it would come in form of the updated financial minutes. The assessment is for all facilities that are being used, i.e., Fraser, Archer, etc. No funds will be used on facilities that have served its useful life. Funds would have to be added to complete the project.

Mrs. Coats said it is the Board's request to have a review of procurement and provide a list of all facilities with information with categories. Mr. Lewis said the list was a part of the Request for Proposals (RFP) in rank order by age or condition of school for the next building program. As funds become available, projects will be pulled from the list.

Mr. Miller asked about the timeline. Mr. Lewis said the intent is to complete the first group late spring. Each school would show a color-coded by condition on the website with cost of repairs. A twenty year scale will be provided to show when the project would have to be done.

Mrs. Coats inquired further about the assessment process. Mr. Lewis said the end goal is to place it on the website. Mrs. Coats asked for the list of CCSD property. Mr. Bobby said they spoke about it in the Audit and Finance meeting and he would provide it this week.

Mrs. Moffly expressed concerns about spending huge amounts for electricity for vacant buildings.

B. Chicora Elementary Demo & Abatement

Mr. Garrett moved, seconded by Mr. Miller, to approve the recommendation authorizing staff to enter into a contract with the lowest responsible bidder for the demolition and abatement of Chicora Elementary School. The funding source is the one cent sales tax revenues in the amount of \$775,000.00. The vote was 6-0. Note: Mr. Miller did not vote on this item since he was out of the room during the vote.

Mrs. Coats asked if the project is on schedule. Mr. Lewis confirmed. He said the historic part of the building would not be demolished.

Rev. Collins asked about assurance for minority business participation. Mr. Lewis said it is written in the construction contract to meet the goals. Mr. Lewis spoke about sealed bids, "Not to Exceed" process and procedures to get clearance for the title. He said funds are included in the project to get the title on a small piece of property they are trying to obtain at the edge of the property identified for the school. Funds are included in the project to secure property the city took over earlier. The Real Estate Attorney has been working with the City and its staff to get clearance on the small piece. However, the intent is not to let the clearance of this property hold up the \$5 million school. The good thing is that the small area of property is at the edge of the property sited for the building.

Mr. Ducker asked about the demolition of property on Success Street to Military Magnet. Mr. Lewis confirmed and said 10-15 small buildings would be demolished. He said there would be a K-12 facility there in the entrance of North Charleston.

10.2: Policy Committee – Mr. Chris Fraser

A. Policy Committee Charter

Mr. Ducker moved, seconded by Mrs. Moffly, to approve the charter for the Policy Committee with language to state that policies would be managed—on CCSD website after first reading and second reading. The vote was 7-0.

Mr. Ducker said the Policy and Personnel charter would be merged.

Mrs. Coats asked if there is language to state how policies should be managed and placed on the CCSD website after first and second readings. It was determined that the charter would be amended to include placing the first and second readings of policies on Microscribe.

10.3: Strategic Education Committee – Mr. Michael Miller

A. Strategic Education Committee Charter

Mr. Miller moved, seconded by Mrs. Moffly, to approve the charter for the Strategic Education Committee. The vote was 7-0.

Mrs. Coats asked about the first sentence regarding the Board giving the Committee the ability to conduct the oversight of district plans and programs. She stated for the record that the Board wants to have the final. Mrs. Coats said Committees should make recommendations to the Board. Mr. Ducker asked if the word grant should be changed. Mr. Ascue suggested the word be changed to grant authority to bring recommendations to the Board for approval, even if the committee disagrees with it. It was the consensus of the Board that committees could not stop items from coming before the Board.

Mrs. Moffly said that's why there should always be an odd number of committee members. Mr. Ducker agreed with Mrs. Moffly and said items could get stuck in the committee if two members voted against an item.

Mrs. Coats asked if there is a mechanism in place to force a committee to bring an item out of committee. Mr. Ducker said an individual or four members could bring it to the chair if there wasn't a sponsoring committee. Mrs. Coats asked if the Strategic Education Committee could block a recommendation from the district and stop it from going to the full board for approval. Mr. Ascue and Mr. Miller agreed that items not approved by the Committee should come to the board. Mr. Ducker and Mrs. Moffly disagreed. Mr. Miller reiterated that issues voted down in Committee meetings should at least come before the Board for conversation.

Mr. Ducker asked the Board's authority when it comes to Board Committees saying that an item has been reviewed and it is not something the Committee wanted to forward to the Board.

Mr. Garrett said he favored the recommendation as long as four Board members had the right to place something on the Board agenda. Mr. Ducker said four members could either take items to a Committee or to the Board Chair if there is no sponsoring committee. If the Committee does not approve an agenda item, someone could take the recommendation to the Board Chair to appeal the Committee's decision.

Mrs. Coats inquired further about the process if agenda items were not approved by a Committee. After discussion, it was determined that there should be a policy to address the process of handling agenda items that may not be supported by the reviewing committee. Mrs. Coats said no committee should stop agenda items from coming forward. Mrs. Moffly said the Board policy on Committee Meetings could be amended to include language to address the issue. She further stated that it is a policy issue, not a charter issue.

Rev. Collins asked again what would be the process if board members had items that lacked support. He said a Committee would lose its integrity and authenticity if it blocked items from going forward

Mr. Garrett said he wouldn't want the Board to consider all items voted down in a Committee meeting.

Mrs. Coats said each committee would have three members. Therefore two votes could determine the action of a committee. She wouldn't want the public to think that two board members are making board decisions when there are nine members responsible for making decisions. If the Committee does not approve an item, one could chose to take an item forward at their own-risk. Mrs. Coats said there will be three board committees with three board members on each. The Board chair will not have a committee assignment. Mr. Miller concluded that any agenda item voted down by a committee should be brought to the full board with clarification why it was not supported.

B. School/Community Task Force Meetings

Mr. Ascue moved, seconded by Mr. Ducker, to approve the Strategic Education Committee's recommendation to amend the School/Community Task Force voting process and omit everything else. The motion failed. The vote was 2-1-4 (Collins and Miller supported the recommendation; Moffly abstained; Ascue, Coats, Ducker and Garrett opposed).

Mrs. Coats asked who composed the agenda. Dr. Nelson responded that it was done by the facilitator and that the minutes are posted on the website.

Mr. Ducker said the intent was to involve the PTA President in the process of approving the minutes. Rev. Collins said the meeting should be announced appropriately. Mrs. Coats said that was established earlier.

Mr. Ascue asked what would happen if no decision was made within six months. Mrs. Coats said the only change is the weighted votes and the minutes being held by the PTA President.

Mrs. Coats asked who is responsible if something is not done appropriately. Currently the district employee is responsible for posting the meeting, minutes, etc. Rev. Collins said the secretary takes the minutes. Mr. Miller said that individuals' duties would remain the same. Mrs. Coats said she reviewed the recommendation and the only changes were weighted votes and minutes being held by the principal and PTA president. The minutes were previously the responsibility of facilitator and they are also responsible for posting the meeting notice, distribution of minutes, and ensuring that everything is done properly.

Mr. Ducker said the intent is to ensure that the Principal and PTA President receive the minutes. Mrs. Coats said that was established earlier.

Mr. Garrett said his concern with the change is that there is a concern that the district controls the information without community input.

Mr. Ascue said he has concerns about weighted votes because he felt individuals should have equal voting rights.

Mr. Miller said he didn't feel non-parents should have same voting rights as parents.

Mrs. Coats read the current process and asked what the Strategic Education Committee didn't like about it. Rev. Collins said there was a possibility of having 15-20 staff members on the committee and only two parents on the committee. Mrs. Coats said if that's the case, maybe membership numbers should be changed. Dr. McGinley said non-parents were added to help design neighborhood schools so they would consider sending their student there. The intent is to have everyone own the recommendation. The facilitator's job is difficult and they are held accountable for posting meeting notice and minutes. Rev. Collins said that doesn't change. Mr. Ducker said they are only requesting that minutes be given to PTA President and Principal. Dr. Nelson said everyone on Task Force is already receiving the minutes. Rev. Collins said this just makes it official.

Mr. Miller suggested deleting the part about minutes being given to the PTA President and Principals because staff just confirmed that they are already receiving the minutes. After Mrs. Coats read the current process, it was determined that this change wasn't needed.

Mr. Ducker asked Rev. Collins if he would just deal with the weighted voting at this time. Rev. Collins said he wanted the PTA President and Principal to work on the agenda. Dr. Nelson said the agenda is prepared with input from the Task Force. Mrs. Coats said because this is already happening, there is no need to make changes. She said she attended community meetings and witnessed that it is already happening.

Dr. McGinley said weighted voting was not recommended. Also, it would be a recordkeeping issue. Rev. Collins said staff members are influenced by their supervisor.

Mr. Ducker called for the question.

10.4: Ad Hoc Committee – Mr. Tom Ducker

A. Ad Hoc Committee Recommendations

Mr. Ascue moved, seconded by Mr. Miller, to approve the recommendations presented by the Ad Hoc Committee on October 14, 2013 and October 28, 2013, with amendment from Mr. Garrett that four members may place an item on the agenda for board consideration. The vote was 6-1 (Moffly).

Mr. Ducker commented on two things that everyone should be aware of. Nov 25th Academic meeting and Dec. 9th would be an Academic meeting. The chair was strongly urged to abide by rules unless there is an urgent matter to be addressed. Mr. Ducker said Policy changes would be made to further define the process.

Mrs. Moffly said she understood Mr. Ducker's intent, but she felt the Policy should be provided before the recommendation is brought for approval when policies take two readings.

Mrs. Coats responded to the question about four board members placing an item on the agenda. She suggested the policy be amended to say that Four Board members could bring an item to the Board to take action.

Mr. Ducker said that's the issue, items are placed on the agenda and brought forward without documentation. However, the Board could send it back to a Committee for vetting.

Mr. Garrett said he did not want an item to not go forward because it was stopped by the committee. Rev. Collins said the item could be approved but should not impact policy.

XI. POTENTIAL CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS

11.1: A. Parking Garage Costs Downtown – Mr. Michael Bobby, Chief Financial & Operations Officer

Mrs. Moffly moved, seconded by Mr. Garrett, to approve the recommendation for parking garage costs for Memminger ES and Buist Academy. The funding source is General Operating Funds in the amount of \$96,800. The vote was 7-0.

B. School/Community Task Force Update – Dr. Brenda Nelson, Director - Office of Community Outreach

The Board received a School/Community Task Force update.

Mr. Garrett thanked the School/Community Task Force Facilitators.

Mr. Ducker requested information on Frierson Elementary and mentioned that there was feedback about preserving the school under the Rural School Covenant. He also asked about the emphasis on Informational Technology infusion. Dr. Nelson said the principal is finalizing the proposal which will be sent to her after receiving input from the community.

Mrs. Coats said the Task Force discussed two topics.

Mr. Miller asked about status of the broadband agreement. Mr. John McCarron said he should have input tomorrow. He also said District 9 was different and could be expanded as needed.

Mrs. Moffly asked about updates for other districts. Dr. Nelson said District 10 was not included.

Mrs. Coats said all Task Forces should wrap up by the end of the year.

C. League of Women Voters

Mr. Ascue moved, seconded by Mr. Garrett, to approve the request to invite the League of Women

Voters to conduct a community meeting at Hursey, with Mr. Ducker amendment that input received would be sent to the Strategic Education Committee. The vote was 6-1 (Collins opposed).

Mrs. Coats read the action item from the February 11th board minutes. Dr. McGinley said the recommendation is just to seek Board approval to ask the League of Women Voters to play the independent role of listening and polling parents because staff continues to get competing requests to expand the Montessori program to eighth grade. The League of Women Voters was used when there were dividing opinions at Academic Magnet High.

Rev. Collins said when the Board went to the school there were many attendees that expressed what they wanted. He doesn't see a need to revisit it. Dr. McGinley said it is necessary because parents are requesting an expansion of 8th grade. Rev. Collins said both the traditional and Montessori should be expanded. Mrs. Coats said if there is no action, the Child Development program would be eliminated because of previous board action. Rev. Collins said traditional classes should not be eliminated to add Montessori classes. Dr. McGinley said the League of Women Voters would do it pro bono to see what the majority of parents want. Rev. Collins said why not talk to parents to see what they want. Rev. Collins said if parents come before the Board asking for changes, it is one thing. But when staff come to the board to make this request it is another thing. Dr. McGinley said she doesn't have children at Hursey, but emails were sent to her and other staff members with this request. Mrs. Moffly said the board spoke about Montessori expansion at a different location. Mrs. Coats said the League of Women Voters could determine what is needed. Mrs. Moffly said the traditional program should not be forced out for a new program.

Mr. Ducker said the Board should be okay with having the independent group like the League of Women Voters to do the study. Rev. Collins disagreed. Dr. McGinley said other Montessori programs go to the eighth grade. Mr. Ducker said it just drives the question of long term plans.

Mr. Garrett said it is about getting community feedback. He felt it was a fair way to do it. Mrs. Coats said the February 11th board meeting notes say it would come back to the Board.

At this time Mrs. Moffly called for the vote. Rev. Collins asked if the League of Women Voters survey would over-ride the Neighborhood Planning Team input. Mrs. Coats reminded Rev. Collins that the Board voted earlier to replace the Neighborhood Planning Team with the School/Community Taskforce.

Mr. Miller added that parents attending the community meeting did not oppose having a Montessori Program at another location.

Since there was no other business to come before the Board, at 7:57 p.m., Mrs. Moffly moved to adjourn the meeting, seconded by Mr. Garrett. The motion was approved by consensus.