

I. EXECUTIVE SESSION
4:30 p.m.

A regular meeting of the Board of Trustees of the Charleston County School District was held on Monday, February 13, 2012 at Stall High School, with the following members of the Board present: Mr. Chris Fraser—Chair, Mrs. Cindy Bohn Coats - Vice Chair, Mr. Craig Ascue, Rev. Chris Collins, Mrs. Elizabeth Kandrac, Mrs. Elizabeth Moffly, Mrs. Ann Oplinger, and Dr. Nancy J. McGinley, Superintendent and Executive Secretary. Mrs. Toya Hampton-Green was absent. Staff members Mr. Michael Bobby, Mrs. Audrey Lane, Mr. Bill Lewis, Dr. Brenda Nelson, and Mr. John Emerson were also in attendance.

The news media was duly notified of the meeting and representatives were present.

Chairman Fraser called the Open Session meeting of February 13, 2011 to order at 4:30 p.m. Rev. Collins moved, seconded by Mrs. Oplinger, to go into Executive Session to discuss agenda items listed below. The motion was approved unanimously.

1.1: Student Appeal Decisions – January 31, 2012

1.2: Contractual Matter - James Simons – Selection Recommendation

1.3 FY 2013 Property, General Liability and Workers Compensation Acquisition Strategy

1.4 Workers' Compensation Settlement

1.5 Request for Proposal #P1210 Student Email, Learning Management System and Web Hosting Services

1.6 Personnel Matter

OPEN SESSION

II. CALL TO ORDER, INVOCATION/MOMENT OF SILENCE, & PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

The Board reconvened in Open Session at 5:52 p.m. in the auditorium at Stall High School. Chairman Fraser called the meeting to order. Then he led the group in a Moment of Silence followed by the Pledge of Allegiance.

Mr. Fraser apologized for returning to Open Session late. Then he announced that the Vision 2016 meeting would immediately follow Open Session in the school's cafeteria.

III. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

Mrs. Oplinger moved, seconded by Rev. Collins to adopt the agenda of February 13, 2012 with the following revisions. The motion was approved 6-1 (Moffly opposed).

- Change agenda item #1.6 "Personnel Matter" to "Contractual Matter",
- defer agenda item 11.1A until the next meeting, and
- pull agenda item 11.1B because it's the same as item 10.1A.

Mrs. Kandrac suggested agenda item 1.6 be changed from Personnel Matter to Contractual Matter. After Mr. Fraser announced that agenda item 11.1 A would be deferred, Mrs. Kandrac said it required support from the four board members that placed the item on the agenda. Mrs. Moffly said community inquired about agenda item #6 - **VISITORS, PUBLIC COMMUNICATIONS**. Then she asked why the agenda item was deferred.

Mrs. Kandrac moved, seconded by Mrs. Moffly, to reinstate agenda item 1.6 - **VISITORS, PUBLIC COMMUNICATIONS** at this meeting. The motion failed 3-4 (Collins, Kandrac and Moffly supported the motion).

Mrs. Kandrac said she didn't recall the vote to defer **VISITORS, PUBLIC COMMUNICATIONS**. Mr. Ascue said the community would have the opportunity to address the board after the Vision 2016 Public meeting.

IV. SPECIAL RECOGNITIONS – *Deferred due to 12/12/11 Board Action*

Special Recognitions were deferred due to action taken by the board on 12/12/11.

V. SUPERINTENDENT’S REPORT

- Dr. McGinley congratulated the five finalists for Teacher of the Year listed below. The Teacher of the Year finalist will be announced at the April 20th River Dogs game. She also extended an invitation to board members to attend the event.
 - Ms. Nancy Dabit, sixth grade English Language Arts , Moultrie Middle
 - Ms. Jeneane Grace, resource teacher, Pinehurst Elementary
 - Mr. William Howard, eighth grade science, Thomas Cario Middle
 - Ms. Elizabeth Helen Parker, third grade, Charles Pinckney Elementary
 - Ms. Laura Stanley, middle school science, Daniel Jenkins Creative Learning Center
- The board received information at a recent Board workshop on possible priorities for next year’s budget. Dr. McGinley shared two key themes:
 - #1 priority is giving teachers and staff the step and cost-of-living increases they deserve. She considered it part of recognizing what it has taken to earn CCSD’s best report card in history, with an “Excellent” growth rating.
 - The district is performance-driven and while the district doesn’t have an evaluation system that ties performance to pay yet, pieces of the evaluation system is being worked on. The salary study will look at job descriptions and salaries. The Studer Group is working on connecting work performance with salaries.
 - The district is more focused than ever on what works, and budget proposals reflect this prioritization. It is not about “more”, it’s about getting more done with what the district has. Vision 2016 will have four focus areas: Literacy-based learning, Effective Educators, Innovative Schools & Systems, and Partnerships. These are based on what has worked well over the last few years under “Charleston Achieving Excellence.”
- Dr. McGinley expressed appreciation for all employees.
- A meeting will be held on Friday to discuss budget priorities.
- Next week, on February 24th, the Teacher Gala will be held at the Marriott Hotel. Seats are sold out. Corporate sponsors have stepped up to recognize teachers. This year principals will also be recognized.

Mrs. Kandrac commented about the Studer Group’s presentation at a recent board workshop. She submitted a Freedom of Information request to the district’s in-house attorney after the Studer Group refused to share details she asked for on the four schools mentioned during their presentation to the board. The FOIA response has not been received and the district is paying over \$100,000 to the Studer Group. She asked why no one has responded to her FOIA response. Dr. McGinley said she could not speak for the Studer Group. However, she assumed that they have “confidential contracts” with their clients. CCSD does not have the information. Mrs. Kandrac expressed concerns about the Studer Group stating that their services were “free” up until the last meeting. Then they produced a contract for six figures.

Mrs. Kandrac also inquired about the GALA and why the cost went up this year from \$75 to \$100. She also said the Board was not invited. Dr. McGinley said board members were invited and she assumed the cost was increased to cover expenses. Mrs. Kandrac said it is doubtful that board members would be at the GALA since the SC School Boards Association annual convention was scheduled at the same time. She regrets that board members would not be there to honor teachers.

VI. VISITORS, PUBLIC COMMUNICATIONS - *See item XIII (12/12/11 Board Action)*

VII. APPROVAL OF MINUTES/EXECUTIVE SESSION AGENDA ITEMS

7.1: Open Session Minutes of January 23 2012 & January 24, 2012 (Special Called Meeting)

Mrs. Kandrac said she gave two corrections to Mrs. Stoney earlier. Then, Mrs. Kandrac

moved, seconded by Mr. Ascue approval with necessary corrections. The vote was 7-0.

7.2: Motions of Executive Session of February 13, 2012

1.1: Student Appeal Decisions – January 31, 2012

A. Mrs. Coats moved, seconded by Mrs. Oplinger, approval a motion upholding the decision of the District 2 Constituent Board assigning the student to the Summit Program for the remainder of the semester 5-0-2 (Mrs. Kandrak and Mrs. Moffly abstained).

Mrs. Kandrak requested transcripts from the hearing. Since they weren't provided, she would not vote to approve the student appeal decision.

B. The Board voted on a motion to uphold the district's recommendation remove language in the student's contract to "disturbing school". The vote was 3-3-1 (Ascue, Fraser and Oplinger opposed; Kandrak abstained).

In open session, Mr. Ascue moved, seconded by Mrs. Oplinger, to uphold district's recommendation. The motion was approved 4-2-1 (Collins and Moffly opposed, Mrs. Kandrak abstained).

1.2: Contractual Matter - James Simons – Selection Recommendation

The Board received information regarding the highest ranked qualified firm for the James Simons ES construction project. Mr. Fraser announced that MB Kahn was the highest ranked qualified firm.

1.3: FY 2013 Property, General Liability and Workers Compensation Acquisition Strategy

The Board approved the recommendation for the FY2013 Property, General Liability and Workers Compensation Acquisition strategy. The vote was approved 7-0.

1.4: Workers' Compensation Settlement

The Board approved authorized staff to settle a Workers' Compensation claim. The motion was approved 6-1 (Coats opposed).

1.5: Request for Proposal #P1210 Student Email, Learning Management System and Web Hosting Services

The Board approved a Request for Proposal #1210 Student Email, Learning Management System and Web Hosting Services. The vote was 7-0.

1.6: Personnel Matter

The Board approved a motion to extend an employee's contract. Motion approved 5-2 (Kandrak and Moffly opposed).

Mrs. Kandrak noted that the superintendent did not provide a copy of the contract and the same individual received a contract extension two years ago. The last time the board voted on the contract for this individual, he stated that it was unlikely that he would be with the district in 2011. It's 2012 and his contract is being extended through 2014. Contractual Matter was listed as Personnel Matter on the agenda for the contract extension and comp time recommendations. Finally, she said the public should be able to determine the administrator or they could ask her.

Executive Session adjourned at 5:45pm.

7.3: Financial Minutes of January 23, 2012 and January 24, 2012

Mrs. Oplinger moved, seconded by Mr. Ascue approval of the financial minutes of February 23, 2012 and February 24, 2012. The vote was 7-0.

VIII. CAE UPDATE -Deferred due to 12/12/11 Board Action

CAE Updates were deferred due to action taken by the board on 12/12/11.

IX. MANAGEMENT REPORT(S) -Deferred due to 12/12/11 Board Action

Management Reports were deferred due to action taken by the board on 12/12/11.

X. COMMITTEE REPORT(S)

10.1: **Audit & Finance Committee**

A. Citizen Participants for the Audit/Finance Committee 2012

On Behalf of the Audit and Finance Committee, Mrs. Coats recommended approval of the Citizens Participants recommendation for the Audit and Finance Committee—Mr. Bret Johnson, Mr. Joe Grech, Mr. Bonnie Lester. The vote was 4-4 (Collins, Kandrac, Moffly and Fraser opposed).

During discussion, Mrs. Kandrac said last year the Policy Committee submitted the names of candidates for the Health Advisory Committee. After one person questioned the HAC advertisement, Mrs. Moffly was asked to comply. Mrs. Kandrac requested Mrs. Coats also comply, likewise. She said last January a person was added to the Audit and Finance Committee which is not in compliance with the bylaws. She also questioned why there wasn't a recommendation for the agenda item. Then she proceeded in asking when and where the advertisement was posted for these positions. She also requested the invoice for the advertisement and list of applicants. Mr. Fraser said Mr. Brett Johnson and Ms. Bonnie Lester have been on the Audit and Finance Committee for a while and were approved by an earlier board. Regarding the new member, Mrs. Coats brought a recommendation forward. If Mrs. Kandrac would like to see the position advertised, she should offer a motion to do so. Mrs. Kandrac said she didn't feel need to offer a motion because of an earlier email she received and the Policy Committee had to follow bylaws. However, she said, a new member just showed up on the Audit and Finance Committee because of who he knows. She also suggested there might be a conflict with Chairman Fraser because of his wife's employment and the Studer Group. She said there is a connection and Mr. Johnson from the Citizen's Oversight Committee just appeared on the A&F Committee. Now he is listed as a potential candidate for board approval. The other individual works with SC Federal Credit Union, possibly replacing someone that worked with First Federal in 2010. Then a third person—senior specialist technician. Mrs. Kandrac requested documentation showing when the board voted on these individuals and their Ethics Statements. She said they are required to file a statement of economic interest which is filed with the state because they are handling billions of state dollars. She requested all A&F members be vetted and positions be advertised. Mrs. Kandrac offered to share her email showing the chair was interrogated for putting individuals on the committee. She concluded that this process possibly excluded thousands of community members that would like to serve on the A&F Committee.

Mrs. Coats said Mrs. Kandrac participated by telephone and she may or may not have heard the discussion. All candidates were introduced at the November A&F meeting. She said it wasn't the Policy Committee that members were vetted for. It was an independent committee that makes decisions about what comes or does not come to the Board. She said during her conversations with Mrs. Kandrac over the last year, she suggested that the Policy Committee should do the same thing. She said due to Mrs. Kandrac's suggested the number of community members on the A&F Committee was reduced so it would be less than the number of board members. She said the decision about Mr. Brett Johnson was elected by citizens to be the Chairman of the Public Oversight Committee and be on the A&F Committee and that was publicly advertised prior to him being elected as chair.

Mr. Ascue said while he agrees that the positions should be advertised, the three individuals recommended are three of the finest experts the district could ever find. They spend 3+ hours in meetings reviewing the district's financial documents and assist Mr. Bobby and his staff in making the best decisions with spending taxpayers' dollars. Mrs. Lester serves on several non-profit boards. At the November meeting, the A&F Committee was asked if they wanted to put those individuals on the A&F Committee.

Mrs. Moffly said she felt the same way about the people recommended for the Health

Advisory Board and said it appeared to be double-standards.

Mr. Fraser spoke about the origination of the Citizens Oversight Committee first. Then he said Mrs. Lester's membership had been long-standing. Therefore, the only one questionable is the third position.

Mrs. Kandrac questioned the resumes and said she didn't see any CPAs listed. Mrs. Coats said that was her oversight because she didn't put their degrees on the document. However, two were Certified Public Accountants and all three candidates have Masters Degree in Finance.

Mrs. Kandrac said there were conflicts and she would ask the Ethics Commission to address because she didn't feel ad hoc committee members should be allowed to make financial decisions for the district.

Rev. Collins motioned, seconded by Mrs. to publicly advertise citizens for the Audit and Finance committee. The vote was 6-1 (Oplinger opposed).

Since there was no more information to come before the board, the meeting adjourned at 6:29pm. By consensus.

10.2: **Policy Committee**

XI. POTENTIAL CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS

11.1 **A. Procedures and Guidelines for Surplus Properties** – Collins, Ascue, Kandrac and Moffly

This item was deferred until June 27, 2012.

XII. NEW BUSINESS

XIII. Public Comments – Vision 2016 Public Engagement

The **Vision 2016 Public Engagement** meeting adjourned at 7:12pm